



MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE SENATE

VOL.CXVIII

Wednesday, December 13, 2023, at 3:30 p.m., Council Chambers, Gilmour Hall 111

PRESENT: David Farrar (Chair), Ahmed Abdalla, Maxwell Altman, Paul Andrews, James Benn, Kusum Bhatta, Mark Boda, Narat Charupat, Kim Dej, Paul Faure, Saher Fazilat, Carlos Filipe, Khaled Hassanein, Faiza Hirji, Steve Hranilovic, Jeremiah Hurley, Suleiman Igdoura, Alfonso Iorio, Andy Knights, Sarrah Lal, Graeme Luke, Maureen MacDonald, Sanamdeep Matharu, John Medcof, Rick Monture, Paul O'Byrne, Brenda O'Connor, Heva Olfman, Joëlle Papillon, Stacey Ritz, Kalai Saravanamuttu, Heather Sheardown, Chris Sinding, Dennis Souder, Stephanie Springgay, Pamela Swett, Susan Tighe, Brenda Vrkljan, Mark Walton, Zimo Wang, Renae Watchman, Jeff Weitz, Margaret Zanel, Eugenia Zuroski
Andrea Thyret-Kidd (*University Secretary*), Michelle Zheng (*Associate University Secretary*), Christine Richard (*Associate University Secretary*), Alysha Sless (*Assistant University Secretary*)

REGRETS: Hfsa Awan, Nathan Andrews, Dina Brooks, Lorraine Carter, Claudia Emerson, Saara Greene, Manish Kacker, Lili Litwin, Michael McGillion

OBSERVERS: Catherine Anderson, Monique Beech, Carolyn Brendon, Sandra Carroll, Matheus Grasselli, Bonny Ibhawoh, Melissa Pool, Karen Richmond, Sean Van Koughnett, Barrington Walker, Rob Walters

GUESTS: Patricia Suleiman, *Director, Human Rights and Accessibility*
Lenore Lukasik-Foss, *Director, Sexual Violence Prevention Response Office & Anti-Oppression Programs*
Robert Innes, *Associate Professor and Chair of the Indigenous Studies Department*

OPEN SESSION

David Farrar welcomed members to the meeting and shared his concerns and disappointment regarding the disrespectful tone and tactics displayed at the last Senate meeting adding that it is particularly concerning since it appears to be part of a pattern of behaviour intended to confuse and obstruct the work of Senate, undermine the important work of Senate Committees, and demean the role and responsibilities of the University Secretariat. D. Farrar noted that he is particularly concerned by the inappropriate and disrespectful tone and comments that were directed towards a faculty member and the University Secretary at the last meeting. In his role as Chair, D. Farrar has tried to create an environment that encourages Senators to ask questions and bring forward relevant concerns. As such, discussions were allowed to proceed even where they are not directly related to the formal Senate agenda. As Chair, D. Farrar also has an obligation to ensure that good use is made of Senate's time and that agenda items are addressed properly. The ongoing attempts by some Senators to disrupt the Senate agenda is to the detriment of the majority on Senate. Raising matters that are not on the Senate agenda - or revisiting items that have been addressed at previous meetings - and failing to provide prior notice or complete information, disadvantages other Senators. It is necessary that all Senators are in receipt of relevant materials to enable them to

contribute in an informed way to discussions, should they wish to do so. Otherwise, there is little opportunity for reasonable and rational debate of matters within Senate's purview.

This behaviour also undermines the members of the University Secretariat, who work hard to prepare materials, respond to questions, and support the smooth operation of Senate and the University's academic mission. D. Farrar acknowledged and thanked Andrea Thyret-Kidd and her team in the University Secretariat for their thoughtful, professional, and efficient support of Senate, its committees, and the broader governance processes. D. Farrar noted that we are fortunate at McMaster to have such a knowledgeable and committed team to undertake this important work. As Senators and colleagues, we all have an obligation to uphold the standards of our community, interrupt patterns of inappropriate conduct, and set an example of appropriate standards of behaviour. D. Farrar advised that the Secretariat is always available to respond to questions from Senators, direct enquiries about specific agenda items to relevant offices, and advise on governance processes and procedures. Senators were encouraged to take advantage of the expertise and support that is available. D. Farrar noted that he hopes that as we move towards the holiday season and the new calendar year we can: work together as Senators to re-set the tone of meetings, engage with one another respectfully, and allow space for other voices to speak.

A member noted their appreciation for the comments and that the Senate is a large decision-making body. Discussions must occur at the committee level and strong opinions and disagreements against items should occur at the Committee. The member expressed that items are brought forward to the Senate in a concise way and they would appreciate not having polemic. Another member expressed that the Senate needs to have discussions at times.

D. Farrar acknowledged that we meet today on the traditional territories of the Mississauga and Haudenosaunee nations and within the lands protected by the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement.

The Blue-Ribbon Panel looking into the fiscal sustainability of the post-secondary sector in Ontario recently released its report, which recognized the challenges institutions are facing, and offered some welcome recommendations, including:

- an end to the tuition freeze, and the implementation of a three-year tuition framework;
- an increase of 10% in operating grants, which would be indexed over time; and,
- providing operating grants for currently unfunded domestic students, of which McMaster has 3,200 in STEM programs and Health Sciences.

The government has indicated that it must be satisfied universities are running as efficiently as possible prior to announcing any responses to the Blue-Ribbon Panel's recommendations. McMaster, along with Ontario Council of Universities, is continuing to advocate for a new fiscal framework, and looks forward to next steps from the government, and to understanding how the recommendations will be implemented.

Last week, the federal government announced a change that may impact international students seeking to study in Canada. Starting in January 2024, prospective students will need to show they have access to \$20,635 instead of the \$10,000 requirement that has been in place for the past two decades. This change will not impact international students currently studying at McMaster. The Registrar's Office is assessing what impact this change may have on international student enrolment at the university going forward.

D. Farrar explained that the matter of a grievance was raised at the last meeting has been referred to arbitration in accordance with the collective agreement. As the matter will be proceeding to arbitration for resolution, it would be inappropriate to further discuss at Senate.

D. Farrar advised that Housing and Conference Services is working to address the concerns of residents at the 10 Bay residence and invited Saher Fazilat, *Vice-President of Operations & Finance*, to provide an update on the support for residents and latest information on the water system. S. Fazilat explained that health and safety is a priority. They have been working extensively with internal and external health experts concerning water test results and have been repeatedly assured that there are no major health risks. Drinking water was provided out of caution and the water in the building is being flushed and tested. Students are being asked to share their concerns. S. Fazilat noted that other issues such as the bugs in the laundry room were addressed in early fall and were a one-time situation. Tenants were aware of the construction when moving in, and working hours were reduced to ensure there was quiet time in the morning. Additionally, quiet space at 1 James North has been provided for tenants. Steve Hranilovic, *Vice-Provost & Dean of Graduate Studies*, added that he has been in contact with graduate students and acknowledged the support from Student Affairs, Sean Van Koughnett, *Associate Vice-President (Students and Learning) & Dean of Students*, and Graduate Council.

At the last Senate meeting, during the presentation by S. Van Koughnett on Student Accommodations, there was a discussion about notetaking software. D. Farrar invited S. Van Koughnett to provide an update. S. Van Koughnett explained that they are finalizing the terms of the service agreement with Notetaking and the Privacy Office and Office of Legal Services are assisting with the intellectual property concerns. It will be in place before the start of term and will apply to anyone that has used the program.

1. Approval of Agenda – Open Session

D. Farrar confirmed that no requests had been received to move items from the Consent to the Regular agenda of the Open Session.

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve the Open Session agenda for the meeting of December 13, 2023 and that item 2 be approved by Consent.

The motion was **Carried**.

CONSENT

2. Minutes of the Meeting of November 8, 2023 – Open Session

Motion:

that the minutes of the Open Session of the meeting held on November 8, 2023 be approved as circulated.

Approved by Consent.

REGULAR**3. Business Arising**

There was no business arising.

4. Enquiries

D. Farrar advised that two enquiries on the same matter were received.

A member expressed that faculty members reached out after receiving an email sent by a Senator to a subset of Senators encouraging them to vote for a specific set of candidates and to not indicate any rank for other (to maximize the chance that the former will be elected). Two Senators sent me emails expressing multiple concerns about the email. It was perceived as an attempt to interfere in the election, it implicitly maligned other nominated Senators (e.g., those selected by the SCA), was authored by a single individual but indicated that it represented the views of an undefined group (it used the plural pronoun "We"), it was sent by the VP of MUFA, potentially implying that it represented the views of MUFA. I was asked whether such emails were allowed under Senate rules. The email has important implications for the integrity of the election process and for the collegial nature of the Senate. How can such an email and related activities be viewed in the context of Senate elections? What responses did the Secretariat consider once it learned of the email? What can/should the Senate do to prevent such activities in the future?

Another member shared that they received the email as well and a second email telling them how to vote. They ignored the advice and wondered how to stop this kind of action in the future.

A. Thyret-Kidd, *University Secretary*, explained that the action taken was to inform senators to vote as they wanted, and that there are minimal rules in the Senate By-Laws for this type of election.

5. Communications**1. Equity and Inclusion Office Annual Report**

Barrington Walker, *Vice-Provost, Equity and Inclusion*, presented the report. Patricia Suleiman, *Director, Human Rights and Accessibility*, and Lenore Lukasik-Foss, *Director, Sexual Violence Prevention Response Office (SVPRO) & Anti-Oppression Programs (AOP)*, were in attendance to respond to questions.

B. Walker provided an overview of the Equity and Inclusion Office Annual Report.

Members asked questions regarding the budget and how many investigations have to be referred to external counsel or firms. B. Walker advised that the work is complex and there are a number of demands on the office from early dispute resolution, investigations and public education. The office is currently well supported. P. Suleiman explained that external firms are hired for sexual assault consultations, particularly rape. Everything else is handled internally.

In response to a question around opportunities to advance more cultural aspects of inclusivity, B. Walker explained that EDI leads across the province are all struggling with the demands of compliance work and being asked to further the goals of culture change on campus. B. Walker noted that McMaster provides the ability to do both and there is support from senior leadership to bring in additional help to address culture issues.

A comment was made around the length of time for investigations, and it was explained that complex cases take longer as do cases involving multiple individuals. An internal transcription service has been implemented to assist the process.

This item was for information.

2. Enrolment Figures

Melissa Pool, *Associate Vice-President Academic Planning and Finance* and S. Hranilovic, presented the report.

M. Pool explained that undergraduate enrolment decreased by 0.2% from last year, with 32,105 students being enrolled. McMaster is beyond the enrolment corridor for domestic students and there are four more student level I enrolments for 2023-24 than there were in 2022-23. M. Pool noted that McMaster continues to be a destination of choice and the international market continues to be challenging.

S. Hranilovic explained that full-time graduate enrolment increased by close to 4% and cautioned against looking at the numbers year over year. Most change occurred in the Faculty of Engineering and the Faculty of Business. Full-time Masters enrolment increased by 6.3%, full-time Ph.D. enrolment declined by 0.7% and part-time Ph.D. enrolment increased by 2.4%.

In response to a question of whether any Faculties are overenrolled, M. Pool explained that some Faculties are over target and some are under. In general, enrolment is close to target.

This item was for information.

3. Report from the Vice-President, Research

Andy Knights, *Acting Vice-President, Research*, presented the report.

A. Knights thanked everyone and advised that the current focus of the Office of the Vice-President, Research is on innovation, commercialization and entrepreneurship, Canada's nuclear university, supporting our research centres, institutes and core platforms, research EDI and supporting faculty through research security. Members were advised that a research security support team is in place to support our researchers through new instruction from the government and Senators were directed to the new webpage which provides resources. A. Knights provided an overview of core research platforms program and the McMaster Seed Fund.

This item was for information.

4. Report from the Provost

This item was deferred to the next Senate meeting.

6. Report from Graduate Council

S. Hranilovic provided members with an update on the Graduate Funding Task Force noting that the draft proposal is in the editing stage. They plan to have the report to the Provost in early January and will present it to Senate.

S. Hranilovic explained that on November 14, 2023, Graduate Council approved the following recommendations and now recommends them to Senate for approval:

1. New Program Proposal - M.A. in Indigenous Studies

Robert Innes, *Associate Professor and Chair of the Indigenous Studies Department*, spoke to the new Master of Arts in Indigenous Studies and noted that support was provided by the Graduate Committee, administrators, Faculty of Social Sciences, the School of Graduate Studies and the Provost. R. Innes advised that it is time for southern Ontario to have a graduate program in Indigenous Studies. The Indigenous Studies Department has three research chairs who are successful in research and grants. R. Innes added that the demand for the program is expected to be strong.

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve the establishment of the Master of Arts in Indigenous Studies as recommended by Graduate Council and set out in the attached.

The motion was **Carried**.

A member suggested correcting the package noting that it is a graduate program in a department.

2. Faculty of Business - MBA Program

S. Hranilovic explained that the changes to the MBA program include a redesign to year-one of the MBA program for their co-op and full-time options and a change to admission requirements for the MBA program to incorporate McMaster Bachelor of Technology Program (B.Tech) as an accepted degree for admission to the accelerated option of the MBA program. The redesign of first year will allow for more flexibility.

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve the revisions, for inclusion in the 2024-2025 Graduate Calendar, as recommended by Graduate Council and set out in the attached.

The motion was **Carried**.

3. Faculty of Health Sciences - Community and Public Health and M.Sc. in Rehabilitation Sciences

S. Hranilovic explained that the changes include a change to the admission requirements for the Graduate Diploma in Community and Public Health rather than requiring a course in statistics or mathematics, and the cancellation of the course-based stream of the M.Sc. in Rehabilitation Sciences. The thesis-based stream is retained.

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve the revisions, for inclusion in the 2024-2025 Graduate Calendar, as recommended by Graduate Council changes proposed by the Faculty of Health Sciences and set out in the attached.

The motion was **Carried**.

4. Faculty of Business – Program Changes

This item was for information.

A member asked a question regarding software used for thesis submissions, the usefulness and mandatory nature of the program, and noted that individuals were ensured the data was stored in Canada but the terms outline that data can be stored in the United States. The member explained that the issue was discussed at Graduate Council and asked when the policy can be updated. S. Hranilovic explained that the item was not in the report from Graduate Council. There is a Senate policy that requires all thesis submissions be checked for plagiarism, but does not identify what software will be used. The iThenticate and Turnitin software has servers in Vancouver but cannot guarantee that every piece of data will land in Vancouver. Supervisors submit the thesis, a copy is not stored in the database, and the thesis is checked against the database.

In response to a question regarding the agreement, S. Hranilovic explained that the licence with iThenticate was just renewed for 3 years and there is no initiative to revisit the policy.

7. Report from Undergraduate Council

Kim Dej, *Chair of Undergraduate Council*, encouraged members to read the Annual Report from the Office of the Registrar, Aid & Awards which includes letters from students who have received awards.

- 1. Revisions to Concurrent Certificate Programs**
- 2. Revisions to Existing Diploma Programs**

3. **Terms of Awards**
4. **Annual Reports from the Office of the Registrar, Aid & Awards**

This report was for information.

8. **Report from the University Planning Committee**

This report was for information.

1. **New M.A. Program in Indigenous Studies**

This item was presented for approval through Graduate Council.

9. **Report from the Committee on Appointments**

Joëlle Papillon, *Chair of the Senate Committee on Appointments*, presented the reports.

1. **Committee on Appointments Report – November**

J. Papillon explained that on November 20, 2023, the Committee on Appointments approved the following recommendation and now recommends it to Senate for approval:

1. **Terms of Reference**

- a. Establishment of the Michael G. DeGroot Chair in Genetic Anthropology

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve, for recommendation to the Board of Governors, the establishment of the Michael G. DeGroot Chair in Genetic Anthropology, as circulated.

The motion was **Carried**.

2. **Committee on Appointments Report – December**

J. Papillon explained that on December 11, 2023, the Committee on Appointments approved the following recommendation and now recommends it to Senate for approval:

1. **Terms of Reference**

- a. Establishment of the Homewood Research Chair in Women's Mental Health and Depression

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve, for recommendation to the Board of Governors, the establishment of the Homewood Research Chair in Women's Mental Health and Depression, as circulated.

The motion was **Carried**.

- b. Establishment of the Joseph & Amy Ip Chair in Bio-Innovation

This item was removed from the agenda.

10. Report from the Committee on University Ceremonials and Insignia

Mark Walton, *Chair of the Committee on University Ceremonials and Insignia*, presented the report.

On November 8, 2023, the Committee on University Ceremonials and Insignia approved the following recommendations and now recommends them to Senate for approval:

1. Degree Designation, Abbreviation and Hood

- a. Degree Abbreviation and Hood Design for Master of Biomedical Innovation

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve that the Master of Biomedical Innovation degree assume the degree abbreviation M.B.I. and that it adopt the hood description currently used by the Master of Biomedical Discovery & Commercialization: black silk, lined with crimson, bound on the anterior side with old gold silk and bound on the posterior side with crimson.

The motion was **Carried**.

2. Proposed Parchment Revisions

- a. Notation on Parchment for Joint Degrees

It was explained that joint degrees are done in collaboration with another institution and a single parchment is issued.

It was duly moved and seconded.

that the Senate approve that joint programs at McMaster University be formally recognized with a notation on the degree parchment and that the term 'joint degree' be reserved only for formally approved joint programs.

The motion was **Carried**.

b. Notation on Parchment for Dual Degrees

It was explained that dual degrees are two degrees, one from McMaster and one from another institution.

It was duly moved and seconded,

that the Senate approve that dual degree programs at McMaster University be formally recognized with a notation on the degree parchment and that the term 'dual degree' be reserved only for formally approved dual degree programs at McMaster.

A member asked if the parchments apply to Master of Arts programs. S. Hranilovic explained that it was an oversight and Master of Arts is included.

The motion was **Carried**.

11. **Other Business**

There was no other business.